# Exhibit K PERFORMANCE ASSURANCE PLAN

#### 1.0 Introduction

1.1 As set forth in this Agreement, Qwest and CLEC voluntarily agree to the terms of the following Performance Assurance Plan ("PAP"), prepared in conjunction with Qwest's application for approval under Section 271 of the Telecommunications Act of 1996 (the "Act") to offer in-region long distance service.

#### 2.0 Plan Structure

- 2.1 The PAP is a two-tiered, self-executing remedy plan. CLEC shall be provided with Tier 1 payments if, as applicable, Qwest does not provide parity between the service it provides to CLEC and that which it provides to its own retail customers, or Qwest fails to meet applicable benchmarks.
- 2.1.1 As specified in section 7.0, if Qwest fails to meet parity and benchmark standards on an aggregate CLEC basis, Qwest shall make Tier 2 payments to a Fund established by the state regulatory commission or, if required by existing law, to the state general fund.
- 2.2 As specified in sections 6.0 and 7.0 and Attachments 1 and 2, payment is generally on a per occurrence basis, (i.e., a set dollar payment times the number of non-conforming service events). For the performance measurements which do not lend themselves to per occurrence payment, payment is on a per measurement basis, (i.e., a set dollar payment). The level of payment also depends upon the number of consecutive months of non-conforming performance, (i.e., an escalating payment the longer the duration of non-conforming performance).
- 2.3 Qwest shall be in conformance with the parity standard when service Qwest provides to CLEC is equivalent to that which it provides to its retail customers. The PAP relies upon statistical scoring to determine whether any difference between CLEC and Qwest performance results is significant, that is, not attributable to simple random variation. Statistical parity shall exist when performance results for CLEC and for Qwest retail analogue result in a z-value that is no greater than the critical z-values listed in the Critical Z-Statistical Table in section 5.0
- 2.4 For performance measurements that have no Qwest retail analogue, agreed upon benchmarks shall be used. Benchmarks shall be evaluated using a "stare and compare" method. For example, if the benchmark is for a particular performance measurement is 95% or better, Qwest performance results must be at least 95% to meet the benchmark. Percentage benchmarks will be adjusted to round the allowable number of misses up or down to the closest integer, except when the sample size is 5 or less in which case the rounding will be up to the nearest integer. For example, for a 90% benchmark, the number of allowable misses is

10% times the sample size, rounded to the nearest integer. If the sample size is eight observations, (10% multiplied by 8 = 0.8) is rounded to 1, one miss would be permitted, and the effective benchmark would be 88% (1 minus 1/8).

#### 3.0 Performance Measurements

3.1 The performance measurements included in the PAP are set forth in Attachment 1. Each performance measurement identified is defined in the Performance Indicator Definitions ("PIDs") developed in the ROC Operational Support System ("OSS") collaborative, and which are included in the SGAT at Exhibit B. The measurements have been designated as Tier 1, Tier 2, or both Tier 1 and Tier 2 and given a High, Medium, or Low designation.

#### 4.0 Statistical Measurement

- 4.1 Qwest uses a statistical test, namely the modified "z-test," for evaluating the difference between two means (i.e., Qwest and CLEC service or repair intervals) or two percentages (e.g., Qwest and CLEC proportions), to determine whether a parity condition exists between the results for Qwest and the CLEC(s). The modified z-tests shall be applicable if the number of data points are greater than 30 for a given measurement. For testing measurements for which the number of data points are 30 or less, Qwest will use a permutation test to determine the statistical significance of the difference between Qwest and CLEC.
- 4.2 Qwest shall be in conformance when the monthly performance results for parity measurements (whether in the form of means, percents, or proportions and at the equivalent level of disaggregation) are such that the calculated z-test statistics are not greater than the critical z-values as listed in Table 1, section 5.0.
- 4.3 Qwest shall be in conformance with benchmark measurements when the monthly performance result equals or exceeds the benchmark, if a higher value means better performance, and when the monthly performance result equals or is less than the benchmark if a lower value means better performance.

The formula for determining parity using the z-test is:

$$z = DIFF / \sigma_{DIFF}$$

Where:

$$DIFF = M_{Owest} - M_{CLEC}$$

 $M_{OWEST}$  = Qwest average or proportion

 $M_{CLEC} = CLEC$  average or proportion

 $\sigma_{DIFF}$  = square root [ $\sigma^2$ Qwest (1/n <sub>CLEC</sub> + 1/n <sub>Qwest</sub>)]

 $\sigma^2_{\text{Owest}}$  = calculated variance for Qwest

 $n_{Qwest}$  = number of observations or samples used in Qwest measurement

 $n_{CLEC}$  = number of observations or samples used in CLEC measurement

The z-tests will be applied to reported parity measurements that contain more than 30 data points.

In calculating the difference between Qwest and CLEC performance, the above formula applies when a larger Qwest value indicates a better level of performance. In cases where a smaller Qwest value indicates a higher level of performance, the order is reversed, i.e.,  $M_{\text{CLEC}}$  -  $M_{\text{QWEST}}$ .

4.3.1 For parity measurements where the number of data points is 30 or less, Qwest will apply a permutation test to test for statistical significance. Permutation analysis will be applied to calculate the z-statistic using the following logic:

Calculate the z-statistic for the actual arrangement of the data Pool and mix the CLEC and Qwest data sets Perform the following 1000 times:

Randomly subdivide the pooled data sets into two pools, one the same size as the original CLEC data set ( $n_{CLEC}$ ) and one reflecting the remaining data points, and one reflecting the remaining data points, (which is equal to the size of the original Qwest data set or  $n_{QWEST}$ ).

Compute and store the z-test score (Z<sub>S</sub>) for this sample.

Count the number of times the z-statistic for a permutation of the data is greater than the actual z- statistic

Compute the fraction of permutations for which the statistic for the rearranged data is greater than the statistic for the actual samples

If the fraction is greater than  $\alpha$ , the significance level of the test, the hypothesis of no difference is not rejected, and the test is passed.

#### 5.0 Critical Z-Value

5.1 The following table shall be used to determine the critical z-value that is referred to in section 6.0. It is based on the monthly business volume of the CLEC for the particular performance measurements for which statistic testing is being performed.

TABLE 1: CRITICAL Z-VALUE

| CLEC volume    | LIS Trunks, UDITs, Resale, | All Other |
|----------------|----------------------------|-----------|
| (Sample size)  | UBL-DS1 and DS-3           |           |
| 1-10           | 1.04*                      | 1.645     |
| 11-150         | 1.645                      | 1.645     |
| 151-300        | 2.0                        | 2.0       |
| 301-600        | 2.7                        | 2.7       |
| 601-3000       | 3.7                        | 3.7       |
| 3001 and above | 4.3                        | 4.3       |

<sup>\*</sup> The 1.04 applies for individual month testing for performance measurements involving LIS trunks and DS-1 and DS-3 that are UDITs, Resale, or Unbundled Loops. The performance measurements are OP-3d/e, OP-4d/e, OP-5, OP-6-4/5, MR-5a/b, MR-7d/e, and MR-8. For purposes of determining consecutive month misses, 1.645 shall be used. Where performance measurements disaggregate to zone 1 and zone 2, the zones shall be combined for purposes of statistical testing.

## 6.0 Tier 1 Payments to CLEC

- 6.1 Tier 1 payments to CLEC shall be made solely for the performance measurements designated as Tier 1 on Attachment 1. The payment amount for non-conforming service varies depending upon the designation of performance measurements as High, Medium, and Low and the duration of the non-conforming service condition as described below. Non-conforming service is defined in section 4.0.
- 6.1.1 Determination of Non-Conforming Measurements: The number of performance measurements that are determined to be non-conforming and, therefore, eligible for Tier 1 payments, are limited according to the critical z-value shown in Table 1, section 5.0. The critical z-values are the statistical standard that determines for each CLEC performance measurement whether Qwest has met parity. The critical z-value is selected from Table 1 according to the monthly CLEC volume for the performance measurement. For instance, if the CLEC sample size for that month is 100, the critical z-value is 1.645 for the statistical testing of that parity performance measurement.
- 6.2 Determination of the Amount of Payment: Tier 1 payments to CLEC, except as provided for in section 10.0, are calculated and paid monthly based on the number of performance measurements exceeding the critical z-value. Payments will be made on either a per occurrence or per measurement basis, depending upon the performance measurement, using the dollar amounts specified in Table 2 below. The dollar amounts vary depending upon whether the performance measurement is designated High, Medium, or Low and escalate depending upon the number of consecutive months for which Qwest has not met the standard for the particular measurement.

- 6.2.1 The escalation of payments for consecutive months of non-conforming service will be matched month for month with de-escalation of payments for every month of conforming service. For example, if Qwest has four consecutive monthly "misses" it will make payments that escalate from month 1 to month 4 as shown in Table 2. If, in the next month, service meets the standard, Qwest makes no payment. A payment "indicator" de-escalates down from month 4 to month 3. If Qwest misses the following month, it will make payment at the month 3 level of Table 2 because that is where the payment "indicator" presently sits. If Qwest misses again the following month, it will make payments that escalate back to the month 4 level. The payment level will de-escalate back to the original month 1 level only upon conforming service sufficient to move the payment "indicator" back to the month 1 level.
- 6.2.2 For those performance measurements listed on Attachment 2 as "Performance Measurements Subject to Per Measurement Caps," payment to a CLEC in a single month shall not exceed the amount listed in Table 2 below for the "Per Measurement" category. For those performance measurements listed on Attachment 2 as "Performance Measurements Subject to Per Measurement Payments," payment to a CLEC will be the amount set forth in Table 2 below under the section labeled "per measurement."

TABLE 2: TIER-1 PAYMENTS TO CLEC

| Per Occurrence    |         |         |         |         |         |           |
|-------------------|---------|---------|---------|---------|---------|-----------|
| Measurement Group | Month 1 | Month 2 | Month 3 | Month 4 | Month 5 | Month 6   |
|                   |         |         |         |         |         | and each  |
|                   |         |         |         |         |         | following |
|                   |         |         |         |         |         | month     |
| High              | \$150   | \$250   | \$500   | \$600   | \$700   | \$800     |
| Medium            | \$ 75   | \$150   | \$300   | \$400   | \$500   | \$600     |
| Low               | \$ 25   | \$ 50   | \$100   | \$200   | \$300   | \$400     |

| Per Measurement Cap |          |          |          |           |           |           |
|---------------------|----------|----------|----------|-----------|-----------|-----------|
| Measurement Group   | Month 1  | Month 2  | Month 3  | Month 4   | Month 5   | Month 6   |
|                     |          |          |          |           |           | and each  |
|                     |          |          |          |           |           | following |
|                     |          |          |          |           |           | month     |
| High                | \$25,000 | \$50,000 | \$75,000 | \$100,000 | \$125,000 | \$150,000 |
| Medium              | \$10,000 | \$20,000 | \$30,000 | \$ 40,000 | \$ 50,000 | \$ 60,000 |
| Low                 | \$ 5,000 | \$10,000 | \$15,000 | \$ 20,000 | \$ 25,000 | \$ 30,000 |

## 7.0 Tier 2 Payments to the State

7.1 Payments to the State shall be limited to the performance measurements designated in section 7.4 for Tier 2 per measurement payments and in Attachment 1 for per occurrence payments and which have at least 10 data points each month for the period payments are being calculated. Similar to the Tier 1 structure, Tier 2 measurements are categorized as

High, Medium, and Low and the amount of payments for non-conformance varies according to this categorization.

- 7.2 Determination of Non-Conforming Measurements: The determination of non-conformance will be based upon the aggregate of all CLEC data for each Tier 2 performance measurement. Non-conforming service is defined in section 4.2 (for parity measurements) and 4.3 (for benchmark measurements). The number of performance measurements determined to be non-conforming and, therefore, eligible for Tier 2 payments, is limited according to the critical z-value shown in Table 1, section 5.0. The critical z-value is the statistical standard that determines for each performance measurement whether Qwest has met parity.
- 7.3 Determination of the Amount of Payment: Except as provided in section 7.4, Tier 2 payments are calculated and paid monthly based on the number of performance measurements exceeding the critical z-value for three consecutive months. Payment will be made on either a per occurrence or per measurement basis, whichever is applicable to the performance measurement, using the dollar amounts specified in Table 3 or Table 4 below. Except as provided in section 7.4, the dollar amounts vary depending upon whether the performance measurement is designated High, Medium, or Low.
- 7.3.1 For those Tier 2 measurements listed on Attachment 2 as "Performance Measurements Subject to Per Measurement Caps," payment to the State in a single month shall not exceed the amount listed in Table 3 for the "Per Measurement" category.

TABLE 3: TIER-2 PAYMENTS TO STATE FUNDS

Per Occurrence

| Measurement Group |       |
|-------------------|-------|
| High              | \$500 |
| Medium            | \$300 |
| Low               | \$200 |

Per Measurement/Cap

| Measurement Group |          |
|-------------------|----------|
| High              | \$75,000 |
| Medium            | \$30,000 |
| Low               | \$20,000 |

7.4 <u>Performance Measurements Subject to Per Measurement Payment</u>: The following Tier 2 performance measurements shall have their performance results measured on a region-wide (14 state) basis. Failure to meet the performance standard, therefore, will result in a per measurement payment in each of the Qwest in-region 14 states adopting this PAP. The performance measurements are:

GA-1: Gateway Availability - IMA-GUI GA-2: Gateway Availability - IMA-EDI

GA-3: Gateway Availability – EB-TA

- GA-4: System Availability EXACT
- GA-6: Gateway Availability GUI-Repair
- PO-1: Pre-Order/Order Response Times
- OP-2: Call Answered within Twenty Seconds Interconnect Provisioning Center
- MR-2: Calls Answered within Twenty Seconds Interconnect Repair Center

GA-1 has three sub-measurements: GA-1A, GA-1B, and GA-1C. PO-1 shall have two sub-measurements: PO-1A and PO-1B. PO-1A and PO-1B shall have their transaction types aggregated together.

For these measurements, Qwest will make a Tier 2 payment based upon monthly performance results according to Table 4: Tier 2 Per Measurement Payments to State Funds.

TABLE 4: TIER-2 PER MEASUREMENT PAYMENTS TO STATE FUNDS

| Measurement  | Performance        | State Payment | 14 State Payment |
|--------------|--------------------|---------------|------------------|
| GA-1,2,3,4,6 | 1% or lower        | \$1,000       | \$14,000         |
|              | >1% to 3%          | \$10,000      | \$140,000        |
|              | >3% to 5%          | \$20,000      | \$280,000        |
|              | >5%                | \$30,000      | \$420,000        |
|              |                    |               |                  |
| PO-1         | 2 sec. or less     | \$1,000       | \$14,000         |
|              | >2 sec. to 5 sec.  | \$5,000       | \$70,000         |
|              | >5 sec. to 10 sec. | \$10,000      | \$140,000        |
|              | >10 sec.           | \$15,000      | \$210,000        |
|              |                    |               |                  |
| OP-2/MR-2    | 1% or lower        | \$1,000       | \$14,000         |
|              | >1% to 3%          | \$5,000       | \$70,000         |
|              | >3% to 5%          | \$10,000      | \$140,000        |
|              | >5%                | \$15,000      | \$210,000        |

7. 5 Payment of Tier 2 Funds: Payments to a state fund shall be used for any purpose that relates to the Qwest service territory that may be determined by the State Commission. If the Commission is not permitted by existing law to receive or administer the payments under a state fund, payments shall be made to the state general fund.

#### 8.0 Step by Step Calculation of Monthly Tier 1 Payments to CLEC

8.1 Application of the Critical Z-Values: Qwest shall identify the Tier 1 parity performance measurements that measure the service provided to CLEC by Qwest for the month in question and the critical z-value from Table 1 in section 5.0 that shall be used for purposes of statistical testing for each particular performance measurement. The statistical testing procedures described in section 4.0 shall be applied. For the purpose of determining the critical z-values, each disaggregated category of a performance measurement is treated as

- a separate sub-measurement. The critical z-value to be applied is determined by the CLEC volume at each level of disaggregation or sub-measurement.
- 8.2 Performance Measurements for which Tier 1 Payment is Per Occurrence:
- 8.2.1 Performance Measurements that are Averages or Means:
- 8.2.1.1 Step 1: For each performance measurement, the average or the mean that would yield the critical z-value shall be calculated. The same denominator as the one used in calculating the z-statistic for the measurement shall be used. (For benchmark measurements, the benchmark value shall be used.)
- 8.2.1.2 Step 2: The percentage differences between the actual averages and the calculated averages shall be calculated. The calculation is % diff = (CLEC result Calculated Value)/Calculated Value. The percent difference shall be capped at a maximum of 100%. In all calculations of percent differences in sections 8.0 and 9.0, the calculated percent differences is capped at 100%.
- 8.2.1.2 Step 3: For each performance measurement, the total number of data points shall be multiplied by the percentage calculated in the previous step and the per occurrence dollar amounts from the Tier 1 Payment Table shall determine the payment to the CLEC for each non-conforming performance measurement.
- 8.2.2 Performance Measurements that are Percentages:
- 8.2.2.1 Step 1: For each performance measurement, the percentage that would yield the critical z-value shall be calculated. The same denominator as the one used in calculating the z- statistic for the measurement shall be used. (For benchmark measurements, the benchmark value shall be used.)
- 8.2.2.2 Step 2: The difference between the actual percentages for the CLEC and the calculated percentages shall be determined.
- 8.2.2.3 Step 3: For each performance measurement, the total number of data points shall be multiplied by the difference in percentage calculated in the previous step, and the per occurrence dollar amount taken from the Tier 1 Payment Table, to determine the payment to the CLEC for each non-conforming performance measurement.
- 8.2.3 Performance Measurements that are Ratios or Proportions:
- 8.2.3.1 Step 1: For each performance measurement the ratio that would yield the critical z-value shall be calculated. The same denominator as the one used in calculating the z-statistic for the measurement shall be used. (For benchmark measurements, the benchmark value shall be used.)

- 8.2.3.2 Step 2: The absolute difference between the actual rate for the CLEC and the calculated rate shall be determined.
- 8.2.3.3 Step 3: For each performance measurement, the total number of data points shall be multiplied by the difference calculated in the previous step, and the per occurrence dollar amount taken from the Tier 1 Payment Table, to determine the payment to the CLEC for each non-conforming performance measurement.
- 8.3 Performance Measurements for which Tier 1 Payment is Per Measure:
- 8.3.1 For each performance measurement where Qwest fails to meet the standard, the payment to the CLEC shall be the dollar amount shown on the "per measure" portion of Table 2: Tier 1 Payments to CLEC.

## 9.0 Step by Step Calculation of Monthly Tier 2 Payments to State Funds

- 9.1 Step 1: The total number of Tier 2 performance measurements that measure the service provided by Qwest to all CLECs for the month in question shall be determined. For the purpose of determining the critical z-values, each disaggregated category of a performance measurement is treated as a separate sub-measurement. The critical z-value to be applied is determined by the CLEC volume at each level of disaggregation or sub-measurement.
- 9.1.2 Step 2: The Tier 2 performance measurement for which Qwest's service performance is non-conforming for the month in question shall be identified using the critical z-values from Table 1 in Section 5.0.
- 9.1.3 Step 3: For each performance measurement that is identified as non-conforming, it shall be determined whether the non-conformance has continued for three consecutive months and whether there are at least 10 data points for each month. If the non-conformance meets these conditions, a Tier 2 payment will be calculated and paid as described below and will continue in each succeeding month until Qwest's performance meets the applicable standard.
- 9.2 Performance Measurements for which Tier 2 Payment is Per Occurrence:
- 9.2.1 Performance Measurements that are Averages or Means:
- 9.2.1.1 Step 1: The monthly average or the mean for each performance measurement that would yield the critical z-value for each month shall be calculated. The same denominator as the one used in calculating the z-statistic for the measurement shall be used. (For benchmark measurements, the benchmark value shall be used.)
- 9.2.2.2 Step 2: The percentage difference between the actual averages and the calculated averages for each month shall be calculated . The calculation for parity measurements is % diff = (actual average calculated average)/calculated average. The percent difference shall be capped at a maximum of 100%. In all calculations of percent differences in section 8.0 and section 9.0, the calculated percent difference is capped at 100%.

- 9.2.2.3 Step 3: For each performance measurement, the total number of data points each month shall be multiplied by the percentage calculated in the previous step. The average for three months (rounded to the nearest integer) shall be calculated and multiplied by the result of the per occurrence dollar amount taken from the Tier 2 Payment Table to determine the payment to the State for each non-conforming performance measurement.
- 9.3 Performance Measurements that are Percentages:
- 9.3.1 Step 1: For each performance measurement, the monthly percentage that would yield the critical z-value for each month shall be calculated. The same denominator as the one used in calculating the z-statistic for the measurement shall be used. (For benchmark measurements, the benchmark value shall be used.)
- 9.3.1.2 Step 2: The difference between the actual percentages and the calculated percentages for each of the three non-conforming months shall be calculated. The calculation for parity measurement is diff = (CLEC result calculated percentage). This formula shall be applicable where a high value is indicative of poor performance. The formula shall be reversed where high performance is indicative of good performance.
- 9.3.1.3 Step 3: For each performance measurement, the total number of data points for each month shall be multiplied by the difference in percentage calculated in the previous step. The average for three months shall be calculated (rounded to the nearest integer) and multiplied by the result of the per occurrence dollar amounts taken from the Tier 2 Payment Table to determine the payment to the State.
- 9.4 Performance Measurements that are Ratios or Proportions:
- 9.4.1 Step 1: For each performance measurement, the ratio that would yield the critical z-value for each month shall be calculated. The same denominator as the one used in calculating the z-statistic for the measurement shall be used. (For benchmark measurements, the benchmark value shall be used.)
- 9.4.1.1 Step 2: The difference between the actual rate for the CLEC and the calculated rate for each month of the non-conforming three-month period shall be calculated. The calculation is: diff = (CLEC rate calculated rate). This formula shall apply where a high value is indicative of poor performance. The formula shall be reversed where high performance is indicative of good performance.
- 9.4.1.2 Step 3: For each performance measurement, the total number of data points shall be multiplied by the difference calculated in the previous step for each month. The average for three months shall be calculated (rounded to the nearest integer) and multiplied by the result of the per occurrence dollar amounts taken from the Tier 2 Payment Table to determine the payment to the State.
- 9.5 Performance Measurements for which Tier 2 Payment is Per Measure:

9.5.1 For each performance measurement where Qwest fails to meet the standard, the payment to the State Fund shall be the dollar amount shown on the "per measure" portion of the Tier 2 Payment Table.

#### 10.0 Low Volume, Developing Markets

- 10.1 For certain qualifying performance standards, if the aggregate monthly volumes of CLECs participating in the PAP are more than 10, but less than 100, Qwest will make Tier 1 payments to CLECs for failure to meet the parity or benchmark standard for the qualifying performance sub-measurements. The qualifying sub-measurements are the UNE-P (POTS), megabit resale, and ADSL qualified loop product disaggregation of OP-3, OP-4, OP-5, MR-3, MR-5, MR-7, and MR-8. If the aggregate monthly CLEC volume is greater than 100, the provisions of this section shall not apply to the qualifying performance sub-measurement.
- 10.2 The determination of whether Qwest has met the parity or benchmark standards will be made using aggregate volumes of CLECs participating in the PAP. In the event Qwest does not meet the applicable performance standards, a total payment to affected CLECs will be determined in accordance with the high, medium, low designation for each performance measurement (see Attachment 1) and as described in section 8.0, except that CLEC aggregate volumes will be used. In the event the calculated total payment amount to CLECs is less than \$5,000, a minimum payment of \$5,000 shall be made. The resulting total payment amount to CLECs will be apportioned to the affected CLECs based upon each CLEC's relative share of the number of total service misses.
- 10.3 At the six (6)-month reviews, Qwest will consider adding to the above list of qualifying performance sub-measurements, new products disaggregation representing new modes of CLEC entry into developing markets.

## 11.0 Payment

- 11.1 Payments to CLEC or the State shall be made one month following the due date of the performance measurement report for the month for which payment is being made.
- Payment to CLEC shall be made via bill credits. To the extent that a monthly payment owed to CLEC under this PAP exceeds the amount owed to Qwest by CLEC on a monthly bill, Qwest will issue a check or wire transfer to CLEC in the amount of the overage. Payment to the State shall be made via check or wire transfer.

#### 12.0 Cap on Tier 1 and Tier 2 Payments

12.1 There shall be a cap on the total payments made by Qwest for a calendar year for the State. The cap amounts by state are shown in Attachment 3. CLEC agrees that this amount

constitutes a maximum annual cap that shall apply to the aggregate total of Tier 1 liquidated damages, including any such damages paid pursuant to this Agreement, any other interconnection agreement, or any other payments made for the same or analogous performance under any other contract, order or rule) and Tier 2 assessments or payments made by Qwest for the same or analogous performance under another contract, order or rule.

- 12.2 The monthly cap will be determined by dividing the amount of the annual cap by twelve. The monthly cap shall be calculated by applying all payments or credits made by Qwest under this PAP as well as all payments made or credits applied for wholesale service performance pursuant to interconnection agreements, state rules or orders. To the extent in any given month the monthly cap (i.e., the annual cap divided by 12) is not reached, the subsequent month's cap will be increased by an amount equal to the unpaid portion of the previous month's cap.
- 12.3 In the event the annual cap is reached within a calendar year and Qwest continues to deliver non-conforming performance during the same year to any CLEC or to all CLECs, the Commission may recommend to the FCC that Qwest should cease offering in-region interLATA services to new customers.

#### 13.0 Limitations

- 13.1 The PAP shall not become available in the State unless and until Qwest receives effective section 271 authority from the FCC for that State.
- 13.2 Qwest will not be liable for Tier 1 payments to CLEC in an FCC approved state until the Commission has approved an interconnection agreement between CLEC and Qwest which adopts the provisions of this PAP.
- Owest shall not be obligated to make Tier 1 or Tier 2 payments for any measurement if and to the extent that non-conformance for that measurement was the result of any of the following: 1) a Force Majeure event, including but not limited to acts of nature, acts of civil or military authority, government regulations, embargoes, epidemics, terrorist acts, riots, insurrections, fires, explosions, earthquakes, nuclear accidents, floods, work stoppages, equipment failure, power blackouts, volcanic action, other major environmental disturbances, unusually severe weather conditions, inability to secure products or services of other persons or transportation facilities or acts or omissions of transportation carriers; 2) an act or omission by a CLEC that is contrary to any of its obligations under its interconnection agreement with Qwest or under federal or state law; an act or omission by CLEC that is in bad faith. Examples of bad faith conduct include, but are not limited to: unreasonably holding service orders and/or applications, "dumping" orders or applications in unreasonably large batches, "dumping" orders or applications at or near the close of a business day, on a Friday evening or prior to a holiday, and failing to provide timely forecasts to Qwest for services or facilities when such forecasts are required to reasonably provide services or facilities; or 3) problems associated with third-party systems or equipment, which could not have been avoided by

Qwest in the exercise of reasonable diligence, *provided*, *however*, that this third party exclusion will not be raised in the State more than three times within a calendar year.

- 13.3.1 Qwest will not be excused from Tier 1 or Tier 2 payments for any reason except as described in Section 13.0. Qwest will have the burden of demonstrating that its non-conformance with the performance measurement was excused on one of the grounds described in this PAP.
- 13.4 Qwest's agreement to implement these enforcement terms, and specifically its agreement to pay any "liquidated damages" or "assessments" hereunder, will not be considered as an admission against interest or an admission of liability in any legal, regulatory, or other proceeding relating in whole or in part to the same performance.
- 13.4.1 CLEC may not use: 1) the existence of this enforcement plan; or 2) Qwest's payment of Tier –1 "liquidated damages" or Tier 2 "assessments" as evidence that Qwest has discriminated in the provision of any facilities or services under Sections 251 or 252, or has violated any state or federal law or regulation. Qwest's conduct underlying its performance measures, however are not made inadmissible by its terms.
- 13.4.2 By accepting this performance remedy plan, CLEC agrees that Qwest's performance with respect to this remedy plan may not be used as an admission of liability or culpability for a violation of any state or federal law or regulation. (Nothing herein is intended to preclude Qwest from introducing evidence of any Tier 1 "liquidated damages" under these provisions for the purpose of offsetting the payment against any other damages or payments a CLEC might recover.) The terms of this paragraph do not apply to any proceeding before the Commission or the FCC to determine whether Qwest has met or continues to meet the requirements of section 271 of the Act.
- 13.5 By incorporating these liquidated damages terms into the PAP, Qwest and CLEC accepting this PAP agree that proof of damages from any non-conforming performance measurement would be difficult to ascertain and, therefore, liquidated damages are a reasonable approximation of any contractual damages that may result from a non-conforming performance measurement. Qwest and CLEC further agree that Tier 1 payments made pursuant to this PAP are not intended to be a penalty. The application of the assessments and damages provided for herein is not intended to foreclose other noncontractual legal and noncontractual regulatory claims and remedies that may be available to a CLEC.
- 13.6 This PAP contains a comprehensive set of performance measurements, statistical methodologies, and payment mechanisms that are designed to function together, and only together, as an integrated whole. To elect the PAP, CLEC must adopt the PAP in its entirety, in its interconnection agreement with Qwest in lieu of other alternative standards or relief. In no event is CLEC entitled to remedies under both the PAP and under rules, orders, or other contracts, including interconnection agreements, arising from the same or analogous wholesale performance. Where alternative remedies for Qwest's wholesale performance are available under rules, orders, or other contracts, including interconnection agreements, CLEC will be limited to either the PAP remedies or the remedies available under rules, orders, or

other contracts and CLEC's choice of remedies shall be specified in its interconnection agreement.

- 13.7 If for any reason CLEC agreeing to this PAP is awarded compensation for the same or analogous wholesale performance covered by this PAP, Qwest may offset the award with amounts paid under this PAP or offset future payments due under the PAP by the amount of any such award.
- 13.8 Qwest shall not be liable for both Tier 2 payments under the PAP and assessments, sanctions, or other payments for the same or analogous performance pursuant to any Commission order or service quality rules.
- 13.9 Whenever a Qwest Tier 1 payment to an individual CLEC exceeds \$3 million in a month, or when all CLEC Tier 1 payments in any given month exceed the monthly cap, Owest may commence a proceeding. Upon timely commencement of the proceeding, Owest must pay the balance of payments owed in excess of the threshold amount into escrow, to be held by a third-party pending the outcome of the proceeding. To invoke these escrow provisions, Owest must file, not later than the due date of the Tier 1 payments, an application demonstrating why it should not be required to pay any amount in excess of the procedural threshold. Qwest will have the burden of proof to demonstrate why, under the circumstances, it would be unjust to require it to make the payments in excess of the applicable threshold amount. If Qwest reports non-conforming performance to CLEC for three consecutive months on 20% or more of the measurements reported to CLEC and has incurred no more than \$1 million in liability to CLEC, then CLEC may commence a similar proceeding. In any such proceeding CLEC will have the burden of proof to demonstrate why, under the circumstances, justice requires Qwest to make payments in excess of the amount calculated pursuant to the terms of the PAP. The disputes identified in this section shall be resolved in a manner specified in the Dispute Resolution section of the SGAT or interconnection agreement with the CLEC.

## 14.0 Reporting

- 14.1 Upon receiving effective section 271 authority from the FCC for a state, Qwest will provide CLEC that has an approved interconnection agreement with Qwest, a monthly report of Qwest's performance for the measurements identified in the PAP by the last day of the month following the month for which performance results are being reported. However, Qwest shall have a grace period of five business days, so that Qwest shall not be deemed out of compliance with its reporting obligations before the expiration of the five business day grace period. Qwest will collect, analyze, and report performance data for the measurements listed on Attachment 1 in accordance with the most recent version of the PIDs. Upon CLEC's request, data files of the CLEC's raw data, or any subset thereof, will be transmitted, without charge, to CLEC in a mutually acceptable format, protocol, and transmission medium.
- 14.2 Qwest will also provide the Commission a monthly report of aggregate CLEC performance results pursuant to the PAP by the last day of the month following the month for

which performance results are being reported. However, Qwest shall have a grace period of five business days, so that Qwest shall not be deemed out of compliance with its reporting obligations before the expiration of the five business day grace period. Individual CLEC reports of participating CLECs will also be available to the Commission upon request. Upon the Commission's request, data files of participating CLEC raw data, or any subset thereof, will be transmitted, without charge, to the Commission in a mutually acceptable format, protocol, and transmission form. By accepting this PAP, CLEC consents to Qwest providing CLEC's report and raw data to the State Commission.

14.3 In the event Qwest does not provide CLEC and the Commission with a monthly report by the last day of the month following the month for which performance results are being reported, Qwest will pay to the State a total of \$500 for each business day for which performance reports are due after a five business day grace period. This amount represents the total payment for missing any deadline, rather than a payment per report. Prior to the date of a payment for late reports, Qwest may file a request for a waiver of the payment, which states the reasons for the waiver. The Commission may grant the waiver, deny the waiver, or provide any other relief that may be appropriate.

### 15.0 Audits/Investigations of Performance Results

- 15.1 Qwest will create a separate financial system which will take performance results as inputs and calculate payments according to the terms of the PAP. An independent audit of this financial system shall be initiated one year after the effective date of the PAP and a second audit shall be started no later than 18 months thereafter. The auditor will be chosen and paid for by Qwest. Alternatively, the Commission may choose to conduct this audit itself. The necessity of any subsequent audits of the financial system shall be considered in the six-month PAP reviews, based upon the experience of the first two audits. If as a result of the audit, it is determined that Qwest underpaid, Qwest will add bill credits to CLEC and/or make additional payments to the State for the amount underpaid. In the event Qwest overpaid, future bill credits to CLEC and/or future payments to the State will be offset by the amount of the overage. All under and over payments will be credited with interest at the one-year U.S. Treasury rate.
- 15.2 In the event of a disagreement between Qwest and CLEC as to any issue regarding the accuracy or integrity of data collected, generated, and reported pursuant to the PAP, Qwest and the CLEC shall first consult with one another and attempt in good faith to resolve the issue. If an issue is not resolved within 45 days after a request for consultation, CLEC and Qwest may, upon a demonstration of good cause, (e.g., evidence of material errors or discrepancies) request an independent audit to be conducted, at the initiating party's expense. The scope of the audit will be limited to performance measurement data collection, data reporting processes, and calculation of performance results and payments for a specific performance measurement. An audit may not be commenced more than 12 months following the month in which the alleged inaccurate results were first reported.

- 15.3 If an audit identifies a material deficiency affecting results, the responsible party shall reimburse the other party for the expense of the third-party auditor, (assuming the responsible party was not the party initiating the audit). In the event CLEC is found to be responsible for the deficiency, any overpayment made to CLEC as a result of the deficiency shall be refunded to Qwest with interest and any affected portion of future payments will be suspended until CLEC corrects the deficiency. In the event that Qwest is found to be responsible for the deficiency, Qwest will pay CLEC the amount that would have been due under the PAP, if not for the deficiency, including interest.
- 15.4 Neither CLEC nor Qwest may request more than two audits per calendar year for the entire region composed of the Qwest in-region states. Each audit request shall be limited to no more than two performance measurements per audit. For purposes of these provisions, a performance measurement is a PID, e.g., OP-3, Installation Commitments Met. CLEC agrees that Qwest shall not be required to conduct more than 3 audits at one time for the region composed of the in-region states, notwithstanding who has initiated the audit, and notwithstanding the provisions in this paragraph. This provision shall exclusively govern audits regarding performance measurements. Qwest agrees to inform Commission Staff and all CLECs of the results of an audit.
- 15.5 Qwest will investigate any second consecutive Tier 2 miss to determine the cause of the miss and to identify the action needed in order to meet the standard set forth in the performance measurements. To the extent an investigation determines that a CLEC was responsible in whole or in part for the Tier 2 misses, Qwest shall receive credit against future Tier 2 payments in an amount equal to the Tier 2 payments that should not have been made. The relevant portion of subsequent Tier 2 payments will not be owed until any responsible CLEC problems are corrected. For the purposes of this sub-section, Tier 1 performance measurements that have not been designated as Tier 2 will be aggregated and the aggregate results will be investigated pursuant to the terms of this Agreement.

#### 16.0 Reviews

- 16.1 Every six (6) months, Qwest, CLECs, and the Commission shall review the performance measurements to determine whether measurements should be added, deleted, or modified; whether the applicable benchmark standards should be modified or replaced by parity standards; and whether to move a classification of a measurement to High, Medium, or Low or Tier 1 to Tier 2. The criterion for reclassification of a measurement shall be whether the actual volume of data points was less or greater than anticipated. Criteria for review of performance measurements, other than for possible reclassification, shall be whether there exists an omission or failure to capture intended performance, and whether there is duplication of another measurement. The first six-month period will begin upon the FCC's approval of Qwest's 271 application for that particular state. Changes shall not be made without Qwest's agreement.
- 16.2 Qwest will make the PAP available for CLEC interconnection agreements until such time as Qwest eliminates its Section 272 affiliate. At that time, the Commission and Qwest

shall review the appropriateness of the PAP and whether its continuation is necessary. However, in the event Qwest exits the interLATA market, that State PAP shall be rescinded immediately.

# 17.0 Voluntary Performance Assurance Plan

This PAP represents Qwest's voluntary offer to provide performance assurance. Nothing in the PAP or in any conclusion of non-conformance of Qwest's service performance with the standards defined in the PAP shall be construed to be, of itself, non-conformance with the Act.

Attachment 1: Tier 1 and Tier 2 Performance Measurements Subject to Per Occurrence Payment

| Performance Measurement                    |                   | Tier | 1 Payme | ents | Tier | 2 Payme | ents |
|--|-------------------|------|---------|------|------|---------|------|
|  |                   | Low  | Med     | High | Low  | Med     | High |
| PRE-ORDER/ORDERS                           |                   |      |         |      |      |         |      |
| LSR Rejection Notice Interval              | PO-3 <sup>a</sup> | X    |         |      |      |         |      |
| Firm Order Confirmations On Time           | PO-5              | X    |         |      |      | X       |      |
| Work Completion Notification Timeliness    | PO-6 <sup>b</sup> | X    |         |      |      |         |      |
| Billing Completion Notification Timeliness | PO-7 <sup>b</sup> | X    |         |      |      |         |      |
| Jeopardy Notice Interval                   | PO-8              | X    |         |      |      |         |      |
| Timely Jeopardy Notices                    | PO-9              | X    |         |      |      |         |      |
| ORDERING AND PROVISIONING                  |                   |      |         |      |      |         |      |
| Installation Commitments Met               | OP-3 <sup>c</sup> |      |         | X    |      | X       |      |
| Installation Intervals                     | OP-4 <sup>d</sup> |      |         | X    |      | X       |      |
| New Service Installation Quality           | OP-5              |      |         | X    |      | X       |      |
| Delayed Days                               | OP-6 <sup>e</sup> |      |         | X    |      | X       |      |
| Number Portability Timeliness              | OP-8              |      |         | X    |      | X       |      |
| Coordinated Cuts On Time – Unbundled Loops | OP-13a            |      |         | X    |      | X       |      |
| MAINTENANCE AND REPAIR                     |                   |      |         |      |      |         |      |
| Out of Service Cleared within 24 hours     | MR-3              |      |         | X    |      |         |      |
| All Troubles Cleared within 4 hours        | MR-5              |      |         | X    |      |         |      |
| Mean time to Restore                       | MR-6a,b,c         |      |         | X    |      |         |      |
| Repair Repeat Report Rate                  | MR-7              |      |         | X    |      | X       |      |
| Trouble Rate                               | MR-8              |      |         | X    |      | X       |      |
| DILL DIG                                   |                   |      |         |      |      |         |      |
| BILLING                                    |                   |      |         |      |      |         |      |
| Time to Provide Recorded Usage Records     | BI-1              | X    |         |      |      |         | X    |
| Billing Accuracy-Adjustments for Errors    | BI-3              | X    |         |      |      |         |      |
| Billing Completeness                       | BI-4              | X    |         |      |      | X       |      |
| NETWORK PERFORMANCE                        |                   |      |         |      |      |         |      |
| Trunk Blocking                             | NI-1              |      |         | X    |      |         | X    |
| NXX Code Activation                        | NP-1              |      |         | X    |      |         | X    |
| COLLOCATION                                |                   |      |         |      |      |         |      |
| Installation Interval                      | CP-1              | X    |         |      |      |         |      |
| Installation Commitments Met               | CP-2              | **   |         | X    |      |         | X    |
| Feasibility Study Interval                 | CP-3              | X    |         |      |      |         |      |
| Feasibility Study Commitments Met          | CP-4              | X    |         |      |      |         |      |
|  |                   |      |         |      |      |         |      |
|  |                   |      |         |      |      |         |      |

a. PO-3 is limited to PO-3a-1, PO-3b-1, and PO-3c.

b. PO-6 is included with PO-7 as two "families:" PO-6a/PO-7a and PO-6b/PO-7b. Measurements within each family share a single payment opportunity with only the measurements with the highest payment being paid.

c. OP-3 is included as three "families:" OP-3a/3b, OP-3c, and OP-3d/e. Measurements within each family share a single payment opportunity with only the measurement with the highest payment being paid.

- d. OP-4 is included with OP-6 as five "families:" OP-4a/OP-6-1, OP-4b/OP-6-2, OP-4c/OP-6-3, OP-4d/OP-6-4, and OP-4e/OP-6-5. Measurements within each family share a single payment opportunity with only the measurement with the highest payment being paid.
- e. For purposes of the PAP, OP-6a and OP-6b will be combined and treated as one. The combined OP-6 breaks down to OP-6-1 (within MSA), OP-6-2 (outside MSA), OP-6-3 (no dispatch), OP-6-4 (zone 1), and OP-6-5 (zone 2).

# **Attachment 2: Performance Measurements Subject to Per Measurement Caps**

## Billing

Time to Provide Recorded Usage Records – BI-1 (Tier 1/Tier 2) Billing Accuracy – Adjustments for Errors – BI-3 (Tier 1) Billing Completeness – BI-4 (Tier 1/Tier 2)

## **Attachment 3: Annual Cap on Qwest Payments**

| State         | 1999 ARMIS | Adjustment for | Annual Cap |
|---------------|------------|----------------|------------|
| (\$ Millions) | Net Return | Commission     | · ·        |
|               |            | Rate Orders    |            |
| Idaho         | 68         |                | 24         |
| Iowa          | 85         |                | 31         |
| Minnesota     | 246        | (18)           | 82         |
| Montana       | 44         |                | 16         |
| Nebraska      | 84         |                | 30         |
| New Mexico    | 89         | (10)**         | 28         |
| North Dakota  | 35         |                | 13         |
| Oregon        | 132        | (32)           | 36         |
| South Dakota  | 42         |                | 15         |
| Utah          | 128        |                | 46         |
| Washington    | 225        |                | 81         |
| Wyoming       | 34         |                | 12         |

The individual state annual payment cap amounts were calculated based upon Qwest's 1999 ARMIS results, adjusted to reflect the full annual effect of subsequent general rate case orders of the respective state regulatory commissions.

<sup>\*\*</sup> The New Mexico adjustment reflects the New Mexico Commission's interim rate order in Docket No. 3007. Permanent rates will be set in Docket No. 3008 and will be reflected in this adjustment when rates are final.